Innovative Ways to Measure Student Success

Dr. Lou Guthrie, Director,
National Higher Education Benchmarking Institute
Student Success = Graduation Rates

- First-time
- Full-time
- Cohort
- 150% of normal time
College Scorecard: Two-year (Associates)

**Gordon State College**
Barnesville, GA
4,031 undergraduates

- Average Annual Cost: $8,798
- Graduation Rate: 14%
- Salary After Attending: $29,900

**College of Coastal Georgia**
Brunswick, GA
2,855 undergraduates

- Average Annual Cost: $11,144
- Graduation Rate: 16%
- Salary After Attending: $28,000

**Chattahoochee Technical College**
Marietta, GA
9,935 undergraduates

- Average Annual Cost: $1,877
- Graduation Rate: 22%
- Salary After Attending: $28,400

**Athens Technical College**
Athens, GA
4,279 undergraduates

- Average Annual Cost: $5,728
- Graduation Rate: 38%
- Salary After Attending: $26,900

VIEW MORE DETAILS

---

[Logo: Benchmarking Institute]
IPEDS Graduation Rates (+ Certificates)  
Full & First, 150%

- All 2-year Degree Granting Institutions = 29%
- Public 2-year = 20%
- Private Nonprofit = 54%
- Private For-Profit = 63%

IPEDS Website, 2016
Graduation Rates

NCCBP Trends: 2006–2015

% of Full-Time, First-Time Students that Completed in Three Years


National Median

N=213
NCCBP 2016 Report Data
Sounds better...

John Barnshaw @JohnBarnshaw 2h

Nearly 70% of first-time, full-time undergraduates eventually graduate via @EdNCES @ipeds_nces
nces.ed.gov/pubsearch/pubs...
Graduation Rates are not a good measure of student success for CCs.

- Cover only approximately 13% of your students – FT, FT, degree-seeking
- Do not cover your part-time students
- Do not cover your transfer mission
- Do not cover your Continuing Education Students
- Do not always cover your high school (dual enrollment) students
- Sometimes covers certificates sometimes not
So who do we blame for the prominence of this metric:

• President Obama, 2009 State of the Union address
• Department of Education and their College Scorecard
• Performance funding
• Achieving the Dream, Complete College America, College Completion Challenge and other initiatives
• Colleges themselves that jumped on the bandwagon and are using graduation rates as KPI
How many of you have graduation rates as one of your Key Performance Indicators?

• Turned graduation rates into an indicator of the success of your entire college
• Uses it to compare you with other colleges
So what do we use instead?
What is student success?

• Success from the college’s perspective.
• Success from your state’s and federal perspective.

• Student Retention (Persistence)
• Educational Attainment
• Academic Achievement
• Student Advancement
• Holistic Development
  • Intellectual
  • Emotional
  • Social
  • Ethical
  • Physical
  • Spiritual
• Success from the student’s perspective.
  • Did you achieve your educational objective?
  • Satisfaction with your college experience?
  • Did your college experience contribute to your well-being?
  • Did your college experience help you get a raise, a promotion, a new job?
Satisfaction Measures

% of Graduates and Completers that Achieved their Educational Goal

- 10th Percentile: 82.41%
- 25th Percentile: 89.00%
- 50th Percentile: 95.00%
- 75th Percentile: 97.70%
- Your College: 98.00%
- 90th Percentile: 99.00%

Data from exit survey or follow-up survey. [2016 NCCBP]

N=138
NCCBP 2016 Report Data
Gallup Purdue Index

• Research shows that the type of institution students attended matters less than what they experienced there.

• Just 3% of all the graduates studied had the types of experiences in college that Gallup finds strongly relate to great jobs and great lives afterward.
Labor Market Outcomes Data

- Salary data not a good overall measure
- Best for program level KPIs
- % of students employed in their field
- % of students that got raises or promotions
Outcomes or Wage Records

- Great Idea, but can be difficult to get.
- Needs disaggregated by major
- Jobs in your field of study vs in another area
- Huge privacy issues

- Lots of people working on these types of measures
- Likely to become the standard in the near future
None of these ideas really work as a great substitute for graduation rates.
3 Ideas that might work for you.

- Success rates that include full- and part-time students, AS/AA or BA/BS degrees, certifications, transfers, and maybe skills builders completion rates
- Percent change in graduation (or graduation/transfer) rates
- Balanced scorecard approach
Note: you must add up your population of full-time and part-time students and then do your %s.
Student Success at JCCC

- Full-time First-Time AS/AA Degrees and Certificates: 42.2%
- Part-time First-Time AS/AA Degrees/Certificates: 1.6%
- Transfer-Ins, Continuing, Reverse Transfers, Others Awarded Degrees/Certificates: 20.1%
- Transfers to 4-year Institutions: 9.0%
- Continuing with Us: 16.0%
- Successful at transferring credits out (passing grades): 0.0%
- Successful at building skills (passing grades): 0.2%

Fall 2014 IPEDS
Headcount 19,429
Using Percent Change to Show Improvement
Commitment to increase student completion by 50% by 2020

- April, 2010: AACC, ACCT, NISOD, League for Innovation, Phi Theta Kappa, CCCSE

Better to measure your success towards this goal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Completions</td>
<td>3116</td>
<td>3048</td>
<td>3066</td>
<td>3364</td>
<td>3712</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4674</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent Change from 2011</td>
<td>-2.18%</td>
<td>-1.60%</td>
<td>7.96%</td>
<td>19.13%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>50.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent Change from Previous Year</td>
<td>-2.18%</td>
<td>0.59%</td>
<td>9.72%</td>
<td>10.34%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Student Completion and Transfer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>YOUR INSTITUTION</th>
<th>NATIONAL PERCENTILES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>% Completed in Three Years</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time, First-time (Fall 2012 Cohort)</td>
<td>14.99%</td>
<td>15.65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part-time, First-time (Fall 2012 Cohort)</td>
<td>7.51%</td>
<td>5.69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>% Transferred in Three Years</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time, First-time (Fall 2012 Cohort)</td>
<td>19.48%</td>
<td>18.92%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part-time, First-time (Fall 2012 Cohort)</td>
<td>8.14%</td>
<td>7.21%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Balanced Scorecard Approach

- Requires additional metrics
- Start by choosing your five most critical performance metrics
- You can then weight them by relative importance
Other KPIs for Student Success

- On-time graduation rates for full-time (15 credit hours), first-time, major selected (take out all undecided), and take out all that indicate they plan to transfer.
- Undecided students tracked. % that have chosen major after one semester and one year.
- Transfer out students: % of those that plan to transfer when admitted that actually do transfer.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Performance Metric</th>
<th>Metric Weighting</th>
<th>Performance Range</th>
<th>Your Actual Performance</th>
<th>Metric Score Score</th>
<th>Balanced Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Graduation Rates</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfer Rates</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of Graduates w/ Jobs</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>77%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median Salary of Graduates</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>$19,000</td>
<td>$62,000</td>
<td>$56,000</td>
<td>86%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loan Repayment Rates</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>91%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

100%
## Creating Index Metrics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Scorecard with Multiple Metrics</th>
<th>COLLEGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>using PERCENT RANKS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Student Satisfaction</strong></td>
<td>93% 64% 43% 86% 100%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Grad Rates</strong></td>
<td>93% 57% 43% 79% 86%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Transfer Rates</strong></td>
<td>100% 92% 46% 69% 0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Undecided Decision Rates</strong></td>
<td>86% 67% 56% 11% 92%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Economic Impact</strong></td>
<td>18% 50% 75% 0% 75%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Continuing Education</strong></td>
<td>25% 78% 63% 92% 38%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>4.15 4.08 3.26 3.37 3.91</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Average</strong></td>
<td>69% 68% 54% 56% 65%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SCORECARD WITH MULTIPLE MEASURES
Based on Percent Ranks
100% = Best

Student Satisfaction
100%
90%
80%
70%
60%
50%
40%
30%
20%
10%
0%

Economic Impact
Grad Rates
Undecided Decision Rates
Transfer Rates

A
Y
L
P
J
Composite Financial Indicator (CFI)

- Primary Reserve Ratio
  - Measures financial strength of the institution

- Net Operating Revenue Ratio
  - Indicates the institution's financial performance as a result of the year's activity

- Return on Net Assets Ratio
  - Determines whether the institution is financially better off than in previous years by measuring total economic return

- Viability Ratio
  - Indicates availability of expendable net assets to cover debt should the institution have to settle its obligations.
Composite Financial Indicator CFI

• Combination of the four core ratios into a single score of institutional financial health

• Each of the four core ratios are weighted
  • Primary reserve ratio – 35 percent
  • Viability ratio – 35 percent
  • Return on net assets ratio – 20 percent
  • Net operating revenue ratio – 10 percent

• Weighting of ratios allows weakness of one ratio to be offset by the strength of another

• Ideal CFI is 3.00 or greater
Composite Success Indicator (CSI)

• What 4-5 Ratios would you include?
  • Overall strength of student success at the institution
    • 6 year graduation & transfer rates (full-time plus part-time)
  • Indication of impact of year’s activity on student success
    • % change in 3 year graduation & transfer rates (full-time plus part-time)
  • Student success trends
    • Persistence rates Fall to Fall trended over time
  • Student learning outcomes
Student Learning Outcomes

• Transfer Performance at 4-year Institutions
• Developmental class successful completion ratios
• Gateway class successful completion
• Percentage of career/technical graduates who pass their required licensure/certification examination.
• Class performance - % of enrollees who pass
Access/Affordability/Diversity

• Seems to have been forgotten with the completion agenda
• % of minority students enrolled/graduated
• % of at-risk students graduated
• % Pell Students or Pell eligible students who graduate
• Tuition Costs/Affordability
• Average Annual Cost (Scoreboard metric)
What would you like to see in a CSI?

• What weights would you incorporate?
Contact Information

Lou Guthrie
louguthrie@jccc.edu | @LouAGuthrie
www.benchmarkinginstitute.org

@EdBenchmark
Learn More about Benchmarking and Best Practices

BenchmarkingInstitute.org

Maria Harper-Marinick
Michelle Asha Cooper
Randy Swing
Student Success